

The Department of Ecology's Supplemental Modeling Report.
A Critical Review.

By David H. Milne, PhD.
Faculty, TESC (ret.)
July, 2018.

Outline.

1. BACKGROUND: ESTUARIES AND DISSOLVED OXYGEN.

- 1-1. Introduction.
- 1-2. The Estuarine Circulation; Giant Unseen Flows.
- 1-3. Oxygen Depletion in Estuaries.
 - 1-3a. The Oxygen Story in Puget Sound.
 - 1-3b. Oxygen Depletion; Seasonal Factors.
 - 1-3c. Oxygen Depletion; The Estuarine Null Zone.
- 1-4. Reading the Oxygen Record.
 - 1-4a. DO Saturation: Key to Understanding Water Quality.
 - 1-4b. Bottom Water Rising in Olympia Harbor.
- 1-5. What's Driving Low September Dissolved Oxygen Levels in Budd Inlet?
- 1-6. What the Budd Inlet Water Quality Controversy is All About.

2. GOOD SIMULATION, MISTAKEN INTERPRETATIONS.

- 2-1. About This Review.
- 2-2. Introduction.
- 2-3. The Budd Inlet Computer Model.
- 2-4. Data Sources.
- 2-5. Encounters with the Department of Ecology.
- 2-6. The Review That Follows.
- 2-7. Good Science ...

3. THE COMPUTER GETS MANY WRONG ANSWERS.

- 3-1. Overview.
- 3-2. Counting Right Answers.
 - 3-2a. Worst Case Scenario.
 - 3-2b. All Model Calculations for the Critical Cell; Flawed?
- 3-3. The Computer's Margin of Error.
- 3-4. The Biggest Source of Error and Confusion of All.
- 3-5. Minimizing Errors; Possibilities and Ecology's Responses.
- 3-6. No More "Natural Estuary" Calculations?

4. THE BUDD INLET ESTUARY; “NATURAL” AND MODERN.

- 4-1. Overview of Chapter 4.
- 4-2. The Missing Natural Budd Inlet Grid Map.
- 4-3. Reminder. Interpreting Grid Maps.
- 4-4. Ecology’s “Non-Grid” Natural Estuary Map.
- 4-5. Ecology’s Natural Estuary Converted to Standard Grid-Map Format.
- 4-6. The Modern Budd Inlet Estuary.
 - 4-6a. The Sizes of the Nutrient Nitrogen Sources Affecting Budd Inlet
 - 4-6b. Budd Inlet Without “The Capitol Lake Dam.” Getting Organized.
 - 4-6c. Table 4-1. Summary and Overview of the SM Report’s Scenario Simulations.
 - 4-6d. Figure 4-7; Grid Maps of the Dam/No Dam Simulations.
- 4-7. “With Dam” Scenarios Compared; Ecology’s vs. This Review’s Versions.
- 4-8. Summary of With/Without Dam Scenario Outcomes.
- 4-9. Budd Inlet is Better Off With the Dam than Without it.
- 4-10. Optional. Figuring Out the Data Used by Ecology in the Scenarios.
- 4-11. Optional. Transforming the Natural Estuary Grid Map.
- 4-12. Optional (continued). Details and Reliability of the Selection Process.
- 4-13. Optional. The Derivation of “Budd Inlet With No Dam” (Figure 4-7c).

5. ECOLOGY’S BUDD INLET SIMULATIONS: FLAWED SCIENCE.

- 5-1. Avoidance of Simulations Likely to Exonerate Capitol Lake.
 - 5-1a. The Missing Simulation of Plant Harvesting ... Background and Evasion.
 - 5-1b. The Missing Simulation of Moxlie Creek’s Effect on East Bay.
- 5-2. Downplaying Solutions Other Than Eliminating Capitol Lake.
- 5-3. Trivial Simulations, Meaningless Graphs.
- 5-4. “The Dam” (Not Capitol Lake) is the Problem ... or is it?
- 5-5. “Increased Residence Time” – So What? – and a Botched Calculation.
- 5-6. Summary.

6. ECOLOGY’S CENTRAL CLAIM: “THE DAM DEPLETES OXYGEN.” WRONG.

- 6-1. Overview. Why the Claim is Mistaken.
- 6-2. The Availability of Nitrate Nutrients at the East Bay Location.
- 6-3. The Arrival of Nitrogen Nutrients at Priest Point.
- 6-4. The Movement of Nitrogen Nutrients Into and Out of West Bay.
- 6-5. Dissolved Oxygen Depletion in East Bay Caused by “The Dam” – *Zero*?
- 6-6. Summary. Likely Causes of Low DO Conditions in East Bay.
- 6-7. Conclusions and a Recommendation.

7. ORGANIC CARBON CLAIMS: MISLEADING, MISTAKEN, NOT CREDIBLE.

- 7-1. Overview.
- 7-2. Background.
- 7-3. The Production of Organic Carbon by Lake and Estuary.
- 7-4. Optional. Estimating TOC from DIN Uptake, using Figures 7-3a and 7-3b.
- 7-5. Results. Estimating TOC from DIN Uptake.
- 7-6. Errors in Ecology's Calculations and Interpretations.
- 7-7. Waterborne TOC in Real Life.
- 7-8. Real Life Estuaries and Lakes.
- 7-9. Summary of Both Cases.
- 7-10. Why are the Modelers Fixated on Phytoplankton?
- 7-11. How Would These Errors Affect Our View of Dissolved Oxygen in Budd Inlet?

8. THE LATE-SEASON DEPARTURE OF ORGANIC CARBON FROM CAPITOL LAKE.

- 8-1. Ecology's "Organic Carbon" Hypothesis and the Real World Alternative.
- 8-2. Seasonal Change in Capitol Lake.
- 8-3. Background for Understanding the Late Fall Decline in Dissolved Oxygen in Budd Inlet.
- 8-4. Incoming and Outgoing Water; The Fall Seasonal Effect on Dissolved Oxygen.
- 8-5. Summary. The Search for a Late-Season Lake Effect.
- 8-6. Optional Technical End Note: Ratio of Biomass Between Macrophyte (Large) Plants and Phytoplankton.

9. CAPITOL LAKE: ERRORS AND FALSE CLAIMS.

- 9-1. There is *No* Real-Life "Oxygen Depletion" in Capitol Lake.
- 9-2. Ecology's "Dissolved Oxygen Deficiencies" in Capitol Lake Were Calculated Incorrectly.
 - 9-2a. Background for the Correct Calculation.
 - 9-2b. Optional: Checking The Dissolved Oxygen Calculation.
 - 9-2c. Optional: The Corrected Dissolved Oxygen Calculations.
- 9-3. The Lake's Calculated Water Quality Violations are Tiny or Nonexistent.
- 9-4. The Phosphorus Wild Goose Chase.
- 9-5. The Eutrophic "Hopeless Phosphorus Red Herring" and the 303-d Listing.
- 9-6. Nutrient Nitrogen – Seldom Mentioned, Never Simulated.
- 9-7. Optional. The DO TABLES Calculations.
- 9-8. Not Optional. The Bottom Line. Capitol Lake is NOT "Oxygen Depleted." ECOLOGY STOP SAYING THAT IT IS!

10. LOW DISSOLVED OXYGEN IN NATURAL ESTUARIES.

- 10-1. The Drive to Sanitize Natural Estuaries.
- 10-2. Eld Inlet – A Modern "Natural" Estuary?
- 10-3. Low Oxygen Levels in Modern Eld Inlet.
- 10-4. Eld Inlet with "Natural" Low DO's; a Second Line of Evidence.
- 10-5. Optional: How the Eld Inlet Profile was Constructed from the Probe Data.
- 10-6. Where Will They Go From Here?